

Concealment of facts is enough to deny any relief in exercise of extra-ordinary discretionary jurisdiction – Delhi HC

3 December 2021



Summary

The Delhi High Court (HC) observed that the petitioner did not disclose the letter through which it had sought release of seized cash from residential premises of its Director. The letter clearly states that petitioner has discharged the tax liability voluntarily and has requested the respondents to not issue any show cause notice in relation to search and seizure. Therefore, the case of coercion being set up by petitioner is an afterthought. No plea of coercion was raised before filing of present petition. Therefore, the HC held that there is concealment of facts and the same is enough to deny any relief to petitioner in exercise of the extra-ordinary discretionary jurisdiction of this Court under Article 226 of Constitution of India.

Facts of the case

- The petitioner¹ had challenged the seizure of cash from the residential premises of its Director. The petitioner further challenged the letter issued by the Revenue, whereby the bank was directed to release the said amount, however, only for payment of government dues².
- The petitioner claimed that a sum of INR 94,65,316, deposited with the Revenue, has been erroneously recovered from the petitioner without proper adjudication.
- The petitioner further prayed for a direction to the Revenue to determine the tax, interest, or penalty due from the petitioner and appropriate the said amount of INR 94,65,316 paid by the petitioner against the amount so found due.

Delhi HC observations and ruling³:

- **Concealment of facts:** The petitioner has apparently set up a false case of panchnama not being served. The copy of panchnama produced clearly bear the acknowledgement of the Director of petitioner company and his wife. Therefore, there is concealment of facts and the same

is enough to deny any relief to petitioner in exercise of the extra-ordinary discretionary jurisdiction of this Court under Article 226 of Constitution of India.

- **Issues of academic importance:** The power to seize cash may not be adjudicated in the present case because the amount seized was released in favour of the petitioner. For condition of the release of amount, it has been observed that the petitioner had deposited INR 60.66 lakh with respondent towards its balance tax, interest and penalty outstanding. The issue is, therefore, only of academic importance.
- **Case of coercion is an afterthought:** The letter clearly states that petitioner has discharged the tax liability voluntarily and has requested the respondents to not issue any show cause notice in relation to search and seizure. Therefore, the case of coercion being set up by petitioner is an afterthought. No plea of coercion was raised before filing of present petition.
- **Benefit of restriction of penalty availed:** As per the provisions⁴, the petitioner can upon making voluntary deposit of tax, interest and penalty avail the benefit of reduction of

¹ Vijay Steelcon Pvt Ltd

² WP(C) 13034/2021

³ dated 18 November 2021

⁴ Section 74(5) of CGST Act

penalty to only 15% of tax. The petitioner had availed such remedy and accordingly search and seizure activities were closed. The petitioner cannot turn around and challenge the said proceedings.

Our comments

The Apex Court⁵ had earlier held that the jurisdiction of the Supreme Court under Article 32 and of the High Court under Article 226 of the Constitution is extraordinary, equitable and discretionary. It is, therefore, of utmost necessity that the petitioner approaching the Writ Court must come with clean hands, put forward all the facts before the Court without concealing or suppressing anything and seek an appropriate relief. If there is no candid disclosure of relevant and material facts or the petitioner is guilty of misleading the Court, his petition may be dismissed at the threshold without considering the merits of the claim.

The Karnataka HC⁶ had also held that suppression of material and vital facts serves to be a legitimate ground to dismiss a writ petition under Article 226 of the Constitution of India, as no discretion can be exercised in favour of a petitioner who has concealed substantial facts from the Court. Thus, it is imperative that due caution is exercised by the taxpayers before approaching the writ courts to avoid dismissal of the writs and enhance the chances of the case being considered on merits.

⁵ K.D. Sharma v. SAIL

⁶ Sri Ananthaswamy v. State of Karnataka

Contact us

To know more, please visit www.grantthornton.in or contact any of our offices as mentioned below:

NEW DELHI

National Office,
Outer Circle, L 41,
Connaught Circus,
New Delhi - 110001
T +91 11 4278 7070

NEW DELHI

6th Floor, Worldmark 2,
Aerocity,
New Delhi - 110037
T +91 11 4952 7400

BENGALURU

5th Floor, 65/2, Block
A, Bagmane Tridib,
Bagmane Tech Park,
CV Raman Nagar,
Bengaluru - 560093
T+91 80 4243 0700

CHANDIGARH

B-406A, 4th Floor,
L&T Elante Office Building,
Industrial Area Phase I,
Chandigarh - 160002
T +91 172 4338 000

CHENNAI

9th Floor, A Wing, Prestige
Polygon, 471 Anna Salai,
Mylapore Division,
Teynampet,
Chennai – 600035
T +91 44 4294 0000

DEHRADUN

Suite No 2211, 2nd Floor,
Building 2000,
Michigan Avenue,
Doon Express Business
Park, Subhash Nagar,
Dehradun - 248002
T +91 135 2646 500

GURGAON

21st Floor,
DLF Square, Jacaranda
Marg,
DLF Phase II,
Gurgaon - 122002
T +91 124 462 8000

HYDERABAD

7th Floor, Block III,
White House,
Kundan Bagh,
Begumpet,
Hyderabad - 500016
T +91 40 6630 8200

KOCHI

6th Floor,
Modayil Centre Point,
Warriam Road Junction,
MG Road
Kochi - 682016
T +91 484 406 4541

KOLKATA

10C Hungerford Street,
5th Floor,
Kolkata - 700017
T +91 33 4050 8000

MUMBAI

11th Floor, Tower II,
One International Center,
SB Marg Prabhadevi (W),
Mumbai - 400013
T +91 22 6626 2600

MUMBAI

Kaledonia, 1st Floor,
C Wing,
(Opposite J&J Office),
Sahar Road,
Andheri East,
Mumbai - 400069
T +91 22 6176 7800

NOIDA

Plot No 19A, 2nd Floor,
Sector - 16A,
Noida - 201301
T +91 120 485 5900

PUNE

3rd Floor,
Unit No 309-312,
West Wing, Nyati Unitree,
Nagar Road, Yerwada
Pune - 411006
T +91 20 6744 8800

For more information or for any queries, write to us at gtbharat@in.gt.com



Follow us @GrantThorntonIN

© 2021 Grant Thornton Bharat LLP. All rights reserved.

“Grant Thornton Bharat” means Grant Thornton Advisory Private Limited, the sole member firm of Grant Thornton International Limited (UK) in India, and those legal entities which are its related parties as defined by the Companies Act, 2013, including Grant Thornton Bharat LLP.

Grant Thornton Bharat LLP, formerly Grant Thornton India LLP, is registered with limited liability with identity number AAA-7677 and has its registered office at L-41 Connaught Circus, New Delhi, 110001. References to Grant Thornton are to Grant Thornton International Ltd. (Grant Thornton International) or its member firms. Grant Thornton International and the member firms are not a worldwide partnership. Services are delivered independently by the member firms.