

## Refund can be claimed where tax is paid under the wrong head under GST- Andhra Pradesh HC

29 August 2022



## Summary

In the present case, the petitioner paid Integrated Goods and Service Tax (IGST) on the transaction considering the location of the supplier and the place of supply in two different states. The authorities alleged such a transaction as intrastate supply of goods and concluded the assessment accordingly. In this respect, the petitioner admitted the nature of the transaction as intrastate supply and requested the authorities to adjust the amount paid as IGST towards the correct liability of Central GST (CGST) and State GST (SGST). However, as mentioned even in the assessment order, the officer cannot adjust the tax paid as IGST towards the tax liability as CGST and SGST. Thus, the Andhra Pradesh High Court (HC) directed the petitioner to pay correct taxes and, thereafter, claim refund of the wrong tax paid.

## Facts of the case

- The petitioner<sup>1</sup>, a works contractor, is engaged in the business of execution of contracts, manufacturing or sale of machinery and general goods and also manufactures industrial products. It is registered under GST in the state of Andhra Pradesh.
- It received a work order<sup>2</sup> for execution of aggregation work on defence vessels in line with the technical specifications given by the Department of Defence.
- The petitioner has executed the work /services at the work site, located in Vishakhapatnam and received the payments from the Ministry of Defence, New Delhi based on the stage wise completion of work. Further, the invoicing is to be done in name of Programme Director, Headquarters ATVP, New Delhi.
- In the present case, the location of supplier and the place of supply are in two different states. Therefore, the petitioner collected Integrated GST and paid it to the government.
- The petitioner received a show cause notice (SCN) alleging the transaction as intrastate transaction. The authorities ignored the submissions made by the petitioner and concluded the assessment considering the transaction as intra-state supply of goods. In this respect, the petitioner requested the authorities to adjust the amount paid under IGST towards the dues payable under both CGST and the SGST, however, the authorities had denied.
- The petitioner filed appeal in respect to the above order which was dismissed. Hence, the petitioner filed the present writ petition<sup>3</sup>.

## Andhra Pradesh HC observations and ruling<sup>4</sup>:

- **Adjustment not tenable:** The officer cannot adjust the taxes paid as IGST towards the tax liability as CGST and SGST. The petitioner is allowed to claim

<sup>1</sup> Walchandnagar Industries Limited

<sup>2</sup> from Ministry of Defence (R&D), Government of India

<sup>3</sup> Writ Petition No.6307 of 2022

<sup>4</sup> Dated 21 July 2022

refund of wrong taxes paid after making payment of correct taxes. Therefore, the objections raised by the petitioner are not acceptable,

- **Court directed the petitioner to pay correct taxes:** The HC noted that the nature of transaction is not disputed and, therefore, it directed the petitioner to pay correct taxes. Further, the petitioner can claim refund of wrong taxes paid as IGST.

## Our comments

Under the GST law, there is no provision to allow the taxpayer to adjust the tax amount paid under wrong head with the correct head. However, the provisions<sup>5</sup> under GST law allow the taxpayer to claim refund of the tax paid under the wrong head.

The Central Board of Indirect Taxes and Customs (CBIC) has issued circular<sup>6</sup> wherein it was clarified that the term 'subsequently held'<sup>7</sup> covers both the cases i.e., mistake observed by taxpayer himself or by the tax officer in any proceeding. Accordingly, refund can be claimed by the taxpayer in both the abovementioned situations<sup>8</sup>.

In case of SBI Cards and Payment Services Limited<sup>9</sup>, the GST department had rejected the refund even after payment of tax made under the correct head, on the ground that the phrase 'subsequently held' could only apply in a case where an adjudicating authority had held whether a transaction was inter-state or intra-state. In this respect, the Punjab and Haryana HC considered the clarification<sup>10</sup> provided in regard of 'subsequently held' and held the case in favour of the petitioner.

---

<sup>5</sup> Section 19 of the IGST Act, 2017 and Section 77 of the CGST and SGST Act, 2017

<sup>6</sup> Circular No. 162/18/2021-GST dated 25 September 2021

<sup>7</sup> Referred in Section 19 of the IGST Act, 2017 and Section 77 of the CGST and SGST Act, 2017

<sup>8</sup> provided the taxpayer pays the required amount of tax in the correct head

<sup>9</sup> Appeal Number CWP-8108-2021 (O&M) and judgment dated 8 October 2021

<sup>10</sup> by virtue of circular 162/18/2021-GST

# Contact us

To know more, please visit [www.grantthornton.in](http://www.grantthornton.in) or contact any of our offices as mentioned below:

---

## NEW DELHI

National Office,  
Outer Circle,  
L 41, Connaught Circus,  
New Delhi - 110001  
T +91 11 4278 7070

## NEW DELHI

6th Floor, Worldmark 2,  
Aerocity,  
New Delhi - 110037  
T +91 11 4952 7400

## AHMEDABAD

Unit No - 603 B, 6th Floor,  
Brigade International  
Financial Center,  
GIFT City Gandhinagar,  
Ahmedabad - 382355  
T +91 11 4278 7070

## BENGALURU

5th Floor, 65/2, Block A,  
Bagmane Tridib,  
Bagmane Tech Park,  
CV Raman Nagar,  
Bengaluru - 560093  
T +91 804 243 0700

---

## CHANDIGARH

B-406A, 4th Floor,  
L&T Elante Office Building,  
Industrial Area Phase I,  
Chandigarh - 160002  
T +91 172 433 8000

## CHENNAI

9th floor, A wing, Prestige  
Polygon, 471 Anna Salai,  
Mylapore Division, Teynampet,  
Chennai - 600035  
T +91 44 4294 0000

## DEHRADUN

Suite No 2211, 2nd Floor,  
Building 2000, Michigan Avenue,  
Doon Express Business Park,  
Subhash Nagar,  
Dehradun - 248002  
T +91 135 264 6500

## GURGAON

21st Floor, DLF Square,  
Jacaranda Marg,  
DLF Phase II,  
Gurgaon - 122002  
T +91 124 462 8000

---

## HYDERABAD

Unit No - 1, 10th Floor,  
My Home Twitza, APIIC,  
Hyderabad Knowledge City,  
Hyderabad - 500081  
T +91 40 6630 8200

## KOCHI

6th Floor, Modayil Centre Point,  
Warriam Road Junction,  
MG Road  
Kochi - 682016  
T +91 484 406 4541

## KOLKATA

10C Hungerford Street,  
5th Floor,  
Kolkata - 700017  
T +91 33 4050 8000

## MUMBAI

11th Floor, Tower II,  
One International Center,  
SB Marg Prabhadevi (W),  
Mumbai - 400013  
T +91 22 6626 2600

---

## MUMBAI

Kaledonia, 1st Floor,  
C Wing,  
(Opposite J&J Office),  
Sahar Road, Andheri East,  
Mumbai - 400069

## NOIDA

Plot No 19A, 2nd Floor,  
Sector - 16A,  
Noida - 201301  
T +91 120 485 5900

## PUNE

3rd Floor, Unit No 310-312,  
West Wing, Nyati Unitree,  
Nagar Road, Yerwada  
Pune - 411006  
T +91 20 6744 8800

---

For more information or for any queries, write to us at [GTBharat@in.gt.com](mailto:GTBharat@in.gt.com)



Follow us @GrantThorntonIN

© 2022 Grant Thornton Bharat LLP. All rights reserved.

“Grant Thornton Bharat” means Grant Thornton Advisory Private Limited, the sole member firm of Grant Thornton International Limited (UK) in India, and those legal entities which are its related parties as defined by the Companies Act, 2013, including Grant Thornton Bharat LLP.

Grant Thornton Bharat LLP, formerly Grant Thornton India LLP, is registered with limited liability with identity number AAA-7677 and has its registered office at L-41 Connaught Circus, New Delhi, 110001. References to Grant Thornton are to Grant Thornton International Ltd. (Grant Thornton International) or its member firms. Grant Thornton International and the member firms are not a worldwide partnership. Services are delivered independently by the member firms.